

**A SCOPING REVIEW: UNDERSTANDING THE POLITICISATION OF SENIOR CIVIL SERVANTS (SCSS)
TURNOVER IN DEVELOPED COUNTRIES**

Ichsani Fahrudin¹ and Noor Cholis Madjid^{2*}

¹Custom and Excise Education and Training Center, Indonesia

² Budgetary and Treasury Education and Training Center, Indonesia

E-mail: ichsanifahrudin@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Senior civil servants (SCSs) are high-level bureaucrats who navigate the intertwining bureaucracy and political stakeholders that shape the political-administrative relationship. One of the recent challenges is a strong indication of "democratic backsliding," which creates a new equilibrium point between the political and administrative constellations. The complexity and dynamic arrangement in developed nations may provide valuable insights and promising avenues for exploring the politicisation of SCSs in developing countries, particularly in Indonesia. The study will examine the politicisation of SCS turnover within elite administrations in developed countries. A scoping review uncovered ten articles with empirical findings that indicate the political-administrative relationships among developed nations from macro, meso, and micro perspectives. The politicisation of SCS turnover has been the subject of scrutiny and debate, with various factors such as actors, institutions, procedures, networks, and path dependency being examined in relation to different sources, forms, times, intentions, and locations.

Keywords: Scoping Review, Politicisation, Senior Civil Servant, Meritocracy

REFERENCES

- Anwar, R., Luddin, M. R., & Wibowo, A. (2021). Appointment of Leader Position: Study on the Regional Government of West Nusa Tenggara. *Indonesian Journal of Social Science Research*, 2(2), 110–118. <https://doi.org/10.11594/10.11594/ijssr.02.02.08>
- Arksey, H., & O'Malley, L. (2005). Scoping studies: Towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 8(1), 19–32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616>

- ASEAN Secretariat. (2021). *Civil Service Modernisation in ASEAN: Towards A Future-Ready Civil Service*. ASEAN Secretariat. <https://asean.org/book/civil-service-modernisation-in-asean-towards-a-future-ready-civil-service/>
- Askim, J., Bach, T., & Christensen, J. G. (2022). Political change and administrative turnover in meritocratic systems. *West European Politics*, 0(0), 1–27. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01402382.2022.2148195>
- Bach, T. (2020). Top officials' careers and the relationship between politics and administration. *NISPAcee Journal of Public Administration and Policy*, 13(2), 35–48. <https://doi.org/10.2478/nispa-2020-0013>
- Berenschot, W. (2018). The Political Economy of Clientelism: A Comparative Study of Indonesia's Patronage Democracy. *Comparative Political Studies*, 51(12), 1563–1593. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414018758756>
- Blaskova, M., Adamoniene, R., & Petrauskiene, R. (2017). Appliance of Public Senior Executives Competences for Municipality Activity Efficiency Development. *INZINERINE EKONOMIKA-ENGINEERING ECONOMICS*, 28(5), 575–584. <https://doi.org/10.5755/j01.ee.28.5.17743>
- Booth, A. (2021). *A Diagnostic Study of the Civil Service in Indonesia*.
- Braun, C. (2013). The Driving Forces of Stability: Exploring the Nature of Long-Term Bureaucracy-Interest Group Interactions. *Administration and Society*, 45(7), 809–836. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399712438377>
- Christensen, J. G., Klemmensen, R., & Opstrup, N. (2014). Politicization and the Replacement of Top Civil Servants in Denmark. *Governance*, 27(2), 215–241. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12036>
- Dahlström, C. (2009). *Political Appointments in 18 Democracies, 1975-2007*. <https://gupea.ub.gu.se/handle/2077/39109>
- Dahlström, C., & Holmgren, M. (2019). The Political Dynamics of Bureaucratic Turnover. *British Journal of Political Science*, 49(3), 823–836. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007123417000230>
- Davis, K., Drey, N., & Gould, D. (2009). What are scoping studies? A review of the nursing literature. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 46(10), 1386–1400. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2009.02.010>
- Ebinger, F., Veit, S., & Fromm, N. (2019). The partisan–professional dichotomy revisited: Politicization and decision-making of senior civil servants. *Public Administration (London)*, 97(4), 861–876. <https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12613>
- Halligan, J. (2012). Leadership and the senior service from a comparative perspective. In B. G. Peters & J. Pierre (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Public Administration* (Second, pp. 115–129). SAGE Publication.
- Howlett, M. (2003). Administrative styles and the limits of administrative reform: A neo-institutional analysis of administrative culture. *Canadian Public Administration*, 46(4), 471–494. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1754-7121.2003.tb01588.x>

- Hustedt, T., & Salomonsen, H. H. (2014). Ensuring political responsiveness: Politicization mechanisms in ministerial bureaucracies. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 80(4), 746–765. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020852314533449>
- Kenny, A., Hyett, N., Sawtell, J., Dickson-Swift, V., Farmer, J., & O’Meara, P. (2013). Community participation in rural health: A scoping review. *BMC Health Services Research*, 13(1), 64. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6963-13-64>
- Kim, P. S. (2007). Transforming Higher-Level Civil Service in a New Age: A Case Study of a New Senior Civil Service in Korea. *Public Personnel Management*, 36(2), 127–142. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009102600703600203>
- Kovač, P., & Virant, G. (2013). Balancing professional standards and political discretion in selecting top officials in Slovenia. *Transylvanian Review of Administrative Sciences*, 40, 137–158.
- Kuperus, H., & Rode, A. (2008). Top public managers in Europe: Management and working conditions of the senior civil servants in the European Union member states. *Maastricht: European Institute of Public Administration*.
- Kuperus, H., & Rode, A. (2016). *Top public managers in Europe: Management and employment in central public administrations*.
- Lægreid, P., & Wise, L. R. (2015). Transitions in Civil Service Systems: Robustness and Flexibility in Human Resource Management. In F. M. van der Meer, J. C. N. Raadschelders, & T. A. J. Toonen (Eds.), *Comparative Civil Service Systems in the 21st Century* (pp. 203–222). Palgrave Macmillan UK. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137491459_11
- Levac, D., Colquhoun, H., & O’Brien, K. K. (2010). Scoping studies: Advancing the methodology. *Implementation Science*, 5(1), 69. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1748-5908-5-69>
- Lopes, A. V., & Vieira, D. M. (2023). Between politics and bureaucracy: A systematic literature review on the dynamics of public appointments. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 36(2), 152–170. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPSM-09-2022-0200>
- Maranto, R., & Hult, K. M. (2004). Right Turn?: Political Ideology in the Higher Civil Service, 1987-1994. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 34(2), 199–222. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074004263352>
- Moon, M. J., & Hwang, C. (2013). The state of civil service systems in the Asia-Pacific region: A comparative perspective. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 33(2), 121–139.
- OECD. (2017). *Government at a Glance 2017*. OECD. https://doi.org/10.1787/gov_glance-2017-en
- Painter, M., & Peters, B. G. (2010). The analysis of administrative traditions. In *Tradition and public administration* (pp. 3–16). Springer.
- Peters, B. G., & Pierre, J. (2004). Politicization of the civil service: Concepts, causes, consequences. In *The Politicization of the Civil Service in Comparative Perspective*. Routledge.
- Sotiropoulos, D. A. (2004). Two faces of politicization of the civil service: The case of contemporary Greece. In *The Politicization of the Civil Service in Comparative Perspective*. Routledge.

Suwitri, S., Supriyono, B., Sulastri, S., & Kuswandaru, O. (2019). *Transactional Politics in Filling High Leadership Positions in Indonesian Bureaucratic Organizations*.

Tjiptoherijanto, P. (2008). Civil service reform in Indonesia. In *Comparative governance reform in Asia: Democracy, corruption, and government trust*. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Wijaya, M. P. H. (2020). *Reforming Indonesian Government Bureaucracy: Political and Statutory Challenges in Reorganisation*. Curtin University.